



Co-production for Basic Infrastructure Improvement, Employment and Income Generation in Low Income Informal Settlements

By Prof Wilbard J. Kombe, Alphonse G. Kyessi,
and Tatu M. Limbumba. Ardhi University, Dar es Salaam

June 2021



UK Research
and Innovation



dpu
Development
Planning Unit



Overview

This policy brief aims to draw attention among policy-makers, practitioners and researchers on the rewarding experiences of co-production and LIT praxis in the delivery of basic infrastructure services in low-income informal settlements. Ultimately this policy paper aims to facilitate re-thinking the conventional approaches to infrastructure improvement in low income informal settlements and provide a policy framework for leveraging, co-production and labour intensive approaches in the initiatives to co-deliver basic infrastructure services and create the desperately employment opportunities in the country

Contents

Part 1 Policy Brief	3
Introduction & facts	4
Interventions	5
Part 2 Policy Paper	6
1. Introduction	7
2. Statement of the problem and objective of the paper	8
3. Methodology	9
4. The essence and application of labour intensive technology in Hanna Nassif	10
5. Policy Thematic Issues and Policy Statements	11
5.1 New partnerships to co-produce basic services	12
5.2 Appropriate environment for sustainable partnerships	13
5.3 Use of appropriate technology	14
5.4 Employment for the marginalised and social cultural transformation	15
5.5 Strengthening intra and inter-city capacity among partners to collaborate and dialogue	16
5.6 Incentives for employment and income generation	17
5.7 Monitoring and learning for improved knowledge	18
6 Key intervention areas	19
Acknowledgments	21



Part 1 Policy Brief

Pictured: Labour intensive work in Hanna Nassif, Image: Ardhi University

Introduction

Co-production of basic services entails the substantive engagement of community in collaboration with a wide composition of stakeholders that include practitioners, local and international organisations, researchers and the civil society. Among other things, co-production facilitates pulling together of and sharing resources, knowledge and experiences held by individuals, various organisations and institutions. On the other hand the use of labour – intensive approaches helped enhance employment and income opportunities particularly among the marginalised groups.

Facts

- i. Although poverty needs have declined from 28.2 percent in 2011-12 to 25.7 per cent in 2020 in Tanzania, poverty remains a chronic problem in urban areas; these are growing rapidly at a rate of 5.2 per cent per annum, leading to increasing number of people living below the national poverty line.
- ii. About 70 per cent of the urban population live in informal settlements; at the same time informal settlements occupy over 50 per cent of the built-up areas in Tanzania, comprise informal settlements which are largely occupied by the urban poor.
- iii. Although unemployment is reported to have declined over from about 3.4 in 2013 to about 2.2 per cent in 2020, trends in unemployment especially among youth are alarming. Limited skills, employment and income generation opportunities in Tanzania have exacerbated urban poverty and inequalities, particularly among women and youth.
- iv. The sustainable development goals (SDGs), specifically goals 5, 11 and 17 have set targets aimed at ensuring that by 2030, all urban dwellers get access to adequate, safe and affordable housing and basic infrastructure services and upgrade slums. Also, the SDGs envisage enhancing inclusive and sustainable urbanisation, building capacity for participatory, integrated and sustainable human settlements planning and management. Most important it aims at halving poverty by 2030.
- v. International organisations led by the International Labour Organisation (ILO) have impressed public institutions especially local governments to use labour intensive techniques; and to encourage the private and community sectors to share responsibilities for urban infrastructure services delivery in low income settlements.
- vi. At the regional and national levels, major policy frameworks and strategies have emphasized on the inclusiveness and substantive engagement of key actors including the marginalised groups in the provision and improvement of basic infrastructure services.

Short-term interventions (1-3 years)

1. Prepare guidelines for scaling up LIT in the co-production of basic community infrastructure services in low income settlements in urban areas
2. Carry out training needs assessment and prepare capacity building action plans
3. Revitalise LIT approaches by establishing outreach community infrastructure improvement projects
4. Based on the annual and medium term plans, prepare programmes and targets for employment and income generation for all types of construction/development projects in the LGAs areas of jurisdiction;
5. Establish frameworks for creating platforms for interaction, collaboration and sharing of resources (i.e. knowledge, skills, experiences and finance)
6. Document and establish dissemination fora/media for all community infrastructure improvement projects in local communities.

Medium-term interventions (3+ years)

1. Develop tools for capacity building, sharing knowledge and building partnerships and cross-sectoral linkages
2. Prepare guidelines and procedures for e procurement of LIT services for organised groups in local communities (i.e. construction, water services, maintenance, micro-finance groups, etc.)
3. Build and transfer LIT skills among marginalised groups in basic infrastructure improvement projects,
4. Identify and address socio-cultural gender constraints and designate tasks and activities for women and youth groups during planning, design and implementation so as to address income and employment equity in basic infrastructure delivery projects
5. Prepare by-laws for effective upkeep including maintenance of community infrastructure services provided in low income settlements.



Part 2

Policy Paper

Pictured: Dilapidated open drain in Hanna Nassif, before improvements (left) and during reconstruction (right), Images: Ardhi University

1. Introduction

Partnerships and co-production have increasingly been underscored as key strategies to deliver basic infrastructure services in low income communities. Co-production of basic services entails the substantive engagement of community in collaboration with a wide composition of stakeholders that include practitioners, local and international organisations, researchers and the civil society. Among other things, co-production facilitates pulling together of and sharing resources, knowledge and experiences held by individuals, various organisations and institutions.

At the centre of co-production lies the challenge of addressing the interconnected problem of basic infrastructure deficit, unemployment and poor wellbeing among low income communities especially in informal settlements. Concurrently, Labour Intensive Technology (LIT) has been deployed to develop basic infrastructure services and ensure that benefits of such improvement processes and projects focus on employment and income needs of the poor.

Policies and the agendas set by international organisations such as UN-Habitat, ILO, the World Bank, and UNDP to address income and employment concerns include:

- i. Incentives should be provided to small-scale contractors to encourage them to use Labour intensive techniques;
- ii. Generating employment for the urban poor through the provision, improvement and maintenance of urban infrastructure and services.
- iii. Promote the use of labour-intensive construction and maintenance technologies which generate employment in the construction sector for the underemployed labour force found in most large cities, while at the same time promoting the development of skills in the construction sector.
- iv. Encourage the establishment of cross sectoral partnerships and support from governments and non-governmental entities including international organisations, local CSOs, CBOs and other institutions that can contribute towards reduction of poverty and improved quality of life in human settlements.

International organisations led by ILO have impressed public institutions especially local governments to use labour intensive techniques; and to encourage the private and community sectors to share responsibilities for urban infrastructure services delivery in low income settlements. In promoting the use of labour-intensive methods in construction and maintenance activities, the development of skills particularly among the marginalised groups such as women and youth is achieved.

Apart from the policies and strategies, the recently proclaimed sustainable development goals, specifically goals 5, 11 and 17 have set targets aimed at ensuring that by 2030, all urban dwellers get access to adequate, safe and affordable housing and basic infrastructure services and upgrade slums. Also by 2030, the SDGs envisage to enhance inclusive and sustainable urbanisation, build capacity for participatory, integrated and sustainable human settlements planning and management.

At national level, major policy frameworks and strategies have emphasized on the inclusiveness of key actors including the marginalised groups in the provision and improvement of basic infrastructure services. For instance, the National Human Settlements Development Policy of 2000 as revised in 2018; the National Strategy for Gender Development and the National Strategy for Growth and Reduction of Poverty I & II have categorically underscored the need to adopt labour-intensive approaches so as to enhance employment and income generation opportunities. In achieving national and international goals, strategies and targets communities have to effectively participate in financing, planning, implementation and monitoring community activities supported by governments and other stakeholders. In addition, civil society organizations are key players in the endeavour to create employment and income and improve social, economic and environmental well-being of particularly low income communities.

2. Statement of the problem and objective of the policy paper

Although poverty levels have declined from 28.2 per cent in 2011/12 to 25.7 per cent in 2020 poverty remains a key concern and major driver of urban inequalities in the country. At the same time urban centres are facing high growth rate of 5.2 per cent annum, growing unemployment widening intra and inter urban socio-economic and spatial gaps. The number of people living below the national poverty line is also increasing. Over 50 per cent of the built-up areas in cities comprise informal settlements which are largely occupied by the urban poor. These settlements are deprived of basic infrastructure services such as access roads, storm water drains, potable water supply, liquid and solid waste collection. Above all, employment and income generation opportunities are highly limited, exacerbating urban poverty and inequalities.

Several attempts by governments to address infrastructure deficits and income poverty through conventional approaches that include provider- based models

have failed to address the dual problem of infrastructure and urban poverty. However, new approaches that combine co-production of basic infrastructure and deployment of appropriate knowledge and skills and employment/income generation that have proved effective in various countries but not been applied much in Tanzania.

Over 50 per cent of the built-up areas in cities comprise informal settlements which are largely occupied by the urban poor.

This policy brief aims to draw attention among policy-makers, practitioners and researchers on the rewarding experiences of co-production and LIT praxis in the delivery of basic infrastructure services in low-income informal settlements. Ultimately this policy paper aims to facilitate re-thinking the conventional

approaches to infrastructure improvement in low income informal settlements and provide a policy framework for leveraging, co-production and labour intensive approaches in the initiatives to co-deliver basic infrastructure services and create the desperately employment opportunities in the country.

3. Methodology

- i. Review of key findings from Hanna Nassif study on co-production of basic services with a view to identifying key issues with implication for policy.
- ii. Documentary review of similar experiences of co-production in basic infrastructure delivery and use of LIT in improving low income settlements. This includes the review of relevant local and international publications and reports.
- iii. Stakeholders consultations with representatives from Hanna Nassif and other communities which were recently upgraded through the Community Infrastructure Improvement Project (CIUPs) in Sandali and Ukonga, Dar es Salaam city.
- iv. Discussion with technical staff from among the Technical Support Team (TST); Kinondoni Municipal Council and Dar es Salaam City Council.

4. The essence and application of labour intensive technology in Hanna Nassif informal Settlement, Dar es Salaam

The delivery of public services inevitably requires mobilization of a variety of resources, including finances, human, equipment, etc. The type of resources depends on the project context i.e. where and how the requirements for basic services have to be delivered. This includes type of services required and the capacity of the beneficiary communities to deliver the same. Critical also are the needs and interests of the partners.

In the Hanna Nassif project, mobilization and utilisation of resources paid special attention to human and financial resources available both within and outside the community. Therefore, unlike in many conventional community infrastructure improvement projects, in this project, the idea was not to collaborate with the inhabitants as “recipients of services” but as active partners with wide range of rights and responsibilities, including contribution in-kind and in-cash, taking leadership roles and mobilising local knowledge and skills required to implement the project. Thus, whilst the objective of the Hanna Nassif project initiative was to improve the living and working conditions of the low income communities living in the settlement, the choice of the project implementation approach also aimed to generate employment and income opportunities particularly for the urban poor.

A labour-intensive technology (LIT) and community contracts were used and internalised during the implementation of infrastructure works in order to tap existing knowledge/skills and generate employment and income. The Hanna Nassif project is first experience to use LIT methods in improving basic services in urban areas in Tanzania.

The implementation method combined conventional engineering knowledge with tacit knowledge, local skills and experiences. Several procedures were adapted during design and implementation including:

- i. Use of modified appropriate standards of roads and other basic services;
- ii. Planning, design and construction with substantive involvement of the community;
- iii. Community construction contracts;
- iv. Creation of work packages and implementation schedules
- v. Capacity building for community-based construction and maintenance of basic infrastructure

Each community member, both men and women, was required to contribute 20% of the daily wage to the project. Other non-monetary contributions included voluntary unpaid leadership and labour to carry out non-construction activities.

The external partners include ILO, UNDP, and the Ford Foundation the financial contribution by these institutions were, largely in a form of grants and not loans.

Mobilization and utilisation of resources paid special attention to human and financial resources available both within and outside the community.

Another important point to underline here is that HNCDA developed and maintained strong and institutionalized networks and linkages with the international development agencies, especially UNDP, ILO, and Ford Foundation as well as with several other local institutions such as National Income Generation Project (NIGP) and the Ardhi University.

Also networks existed, although much less stronger, with supra-public institution namely, the Dar es Salaam City Council (DCC) and the Kinondoni Municipal Council (KMC). However, networks and collaboration with local institutions operating as NGOs that support delivery of basic infrastructure services in low income communities, such as the Centre for Community Initiatives (CCI), or the WAT-Human Settlements (WAT-HS) were generally weak. Stronger links with such local institutions would have created important learning platform where lived experiences from these actors, on matters such as appropriate and strategies of sustaining contributions from the local communities during the post-implementation period would have been uncovered.



5. Policy Thematic Issues and Policy Statements

5.1 New partnerships to coproduce basic services

A number of government documents calls for stakeholders engagement and partnerships in local development projects, programmes and activities. However, in practice, engagement of stakeholders has largely been in form of conventional participation which focuses on mobilisation and engagement with mainly representatives of local communities – i.e. local community leaders. This is so even in the community infrastructure improvement projects (CIUPs) in low income settlements implemented in various local governments in recent years. For instance, community infrastructure improvement projects (CIUP) implemented by private contractors under the Dar es Salaam Metropolitan Project (DMDP) in informal settlements in the city such as Sandali and Ukonga in Dar es Salaam confirm limited consideration given to substantive partnerships. In turn, this has undermined local capacity building, employment and income creation and empowerment, leading to little or poor ownership maintenance of the improved infrastructure.

Policy statements



- i Governments shall put in place mechanisms to guide engagement of local communities with other partners in new ways to co-produce public services
- ii Government shall prepare guidelines to enable local governments to monitor, audit and report to the respective central government ministries/agencies on the nature of public service co-production and their impacts on community.
- iii Central government in collaboration with local authorities shall create a framework that provides for distinct space for local communities to substantively engage in planning, design and construction/development projects undertaken in their areas

Strategies



- i Establish inclusive local committees and build their capacity for co-production and partnering with multiple stakeholders in the specific project areas;
- ii Prepare guidelines to enable local governments to monitor, audit and report to the respective central government ministries/agencies on the nature of public service co-production and their impacts on community.

5.2 Appropriate environment for sustainable partnerships

Creating a conducive environment for key stakeholders to partner, sustainably collaborate and openly share knowledge, experiences and other resources including skills, finances and know – how is central to co-production of basic services in low income settlements. Absence of appropriate environment for interaction and sharing among partners with diverse resources and interests can frustrate initiatives to institutionalise co-production of basic services. The stewardship role of local government cannot be overemphasised inter alia because of their statutory and policy roles and mandates.

Poor environment for interaction and dialogue has undermined the opportunity for income and employment creation for the poor households especially for marginalised groups in low-income informal communities recently upgraded such as Sandali in Temeke Municipality.

Policy statements



- i Central government shall provide guidelines to assist sectoral ministries and parastatals (MoW, MLHSD, TANROADS, TARURA, etc.) to identify and designate projects that can be co-planned, co-designed and co-implemented.
- ii Central government shall provide a framework for anchoring local development/infrastructure improvement projects in the local government system
- iii Local government authorities shall devise and institutionalise mechanisms to facilitate interaction and partnership of equals in the co-production of basic infrastructure in low income settlements.

Strategies



- i Set targets for employment creation for all types of construction/development projects in the LGAs areas of jurisdiction;
- ii Provide guidelines to assist sectoral ministries and pastorals (TANROADS, TARURA, MoW, PO-RALG) and LAs to identify and designate projects that can be co-planned, co-designed and co-implemented.
- iii Develop tools for sharing knowledge and building partnerships that shall spearhead adoption of LIT for employment and income generation;

5.3 Use of appropriate technology for basic infrastructure delivery in low income settlements

Investment in basic infrastructure services such as access to roads, storm drains, water supply and waste management offers abundant opportunities to generate income and employment that can directly address income and employment challenges facing poor households in local communities. For instance, the use of labour-intensive technology and methods can create employment that is desperately required by many unemployed urban residents. Despite the increasing unemployment especially among women and youth most basic infrastructure services improvement projects undertaken in recent years have not adopted labour-intensive methods. As a result the problem of little use of available locally labour, skills and technology persists.

Policy statements



- i Government shall put in place mechanisms at local government and community level to give priority to and optimise the use of locally available skills and labour-intensive methods (employment creation) in basic infrastructure improvement projects.
- ii Government will facilitate capacity building and registration of small contractors and local artisans to organise into labour based community infrastructure construction groups
- iii Government shall give priority to capacity building and skill transfer among low-income women and youth involved in the implementation of basic infrastructure projects in low-income communities

Strategies



- i Prepare plans and programmes based on the annual development plan of LGA that specify the proportionate contribution of LBT and appropriate partnership composition;
- ii Establish special agency and guidelines for recognising, registering and administering (regulate) associations of organised local artisans dedicated to community infrastructure improvement using LBT;
- iii Prepare guidelines and procedures for targeted procurement of LBT services of associations of organised local artisans.

5.4 Employment for the marginalised and social cultural transformation

Employment creation especially for women, youth and other marginalised social groups is critical entry point to address widening income inequalities. Investing in capacity building and skills transfer among women and youth in construction activities helps create income generation opportunities, enhance socio-economic wellbeing among the poorer households. Most importantly it can help understand local perceptions and transform structural socio-cultural norms and values that undermine substantive engagement of women male-dominated income and employment opportunities.

Policy statements



- i Local, foreign contractors and other partners involved in infrastructure implementation shall be required to prioritise skill transfer and employment for the urban poor, women and youth.
- ii Local government shall set targets for employment creation for
- iii All types of construction/development projects in their areas of jurisdiction.
- iv Local governments shall develop a monitoring system to ensure that labour intensive employment targets set for local development projects are met.

Strategies



- i Local, foreign contractors and other partners involved in infrastructure implementation shall be required to prioritise skill transfer and employment for the urban poor, women and youth.
- ii Local government shall set targets for employment creation for
- iii All types of construction/development projects in their areas of jurisdiction.
- iv Local governments shall develop a monitoring system to ensure that labour intensive employment targets set for local development projects are met.

5.5 Strengthening intra and inter- capacity among partners to collaborate and dialogue

In order to enhance the capacity of local communities to work with other partners including the private sector, and ensure long term impacts of local infrastructure improvement projects, the capacity of all stakeholders to dialogue and interact with each other as equal partners is necessary. Unfortunately this has not been the situation in most cases including the recently implemented community infrastructure upgrading projects in low income settlements (CIUPs) in Dar es Salaam and elsewhere in the country.

Policy statements



- i Local governments shall facilitate the creation of platforms for interaction among partners involved in local infrastructure/development projects
- ii Local governments in collaboration with other partners involved in basic infrastructure delivery stakeholders shall put in place mechanisms for enhancing the capacity of local community leaders to negotiate and dialogue and champion partnerships with partners in local development projects.

Strategies



- i Local governments shall develop frameworks for creating platforms to facilitate interaction between local communities and other partners involved in the local infrastructure/development projects
- ii Local government in collaboration with other relevant institutions shall prepare training plans for communities in the infrastructure improvements project areas.

5.6 Incentives for employment and income generation

Central and local governments have to closely cooperate with and create attractive environment for the private sector and other partners to create and opt for project implementation methods that optimise employment or job creation at community level. The idea is to incentivise and support (private) business operators of all size and types to consider employment creation for local communities as one of the key impacts of projects they are involved in.

Policy statements



- i Central government shall put in place a framework for ensuring that employment and income generation for local communities are prioritised during planning and design of infrastructure projects.
- ii Local government in collaboration with respective government agencies and private contractors shall develop mechanisms for categorising and setting local employment generation targets for planned or projects scheduled for implementation within their areas of jurisdiction.
- iii Local government shall devise and put in place incentives to invigorate and reward private business enterprises and other partners which have reached targeted employment generation and excelled in local capacity building.

Strategies



- i Government in collaboration with other partners shall initiate review of relevant public procurement legislations, regulations and practices to support employment and income generation opportunities through LIT.
- ii Local government shall prepare attractive incentive packages for contractors to create employment and income generation opportunities through LIT.

5.7 Monitoring and learning for improved knowledge and practice

Sustainability and continuity of infrastructure improvement projects in low income settlements cannot be achieved without adequate mechanism for post-implementation project monitoring and reporting. This is particularly so in co-produced infrastructure services where more often than not most partners end their engagement once project implementation is complete. This significance of continued monitoring also concern the need for co-learning and reflecting on lessons that can be employed to improve future engagements across projects and partners.

Policy statements



- i Local governments in collaboration with the local community shall put in place mechanisms for post-implementation project monitoring and reporting
- ii Local governments in collaboration with other partners including research institutions will provide mechanisms for documenting and disseminating lessons of experience and betterment of future partnerships in basic infrastructure improvement projects.

Strategies



- i Local government in collaboration with other partners shall document and disseminate lessons of experience for enhanced partnerships in community infrastructure improvement projects.
- ii Local government in collaboration with research institutions shall document local knowledge, norms and values in specific project areas that may facilitate or impede use of LIT and inclusive partnerships in local infrastructure improvement project.

6. Key intervention areas

Short term and long term intervention are proposed in order to effectively institutionalise co-production for basic infrastructure improvement, promote employment and income generation opportunities in low-income informal settlements.

**1-3
Years**

6.1 Short-term interventions

1. Prepare guidelines for scaling up LIT in the co-production of basic community infrastructure services in low income settlements in urban areas
2. Carry out training needs assessment and prepare capacity building action plans
3. Revitalise LIT approaches by establishing outreach community infrastructure improvement projects
4. Based on the annual and medium term plans, prepare programmes and targets for employment and income generation for all types of construction/development projects in the LGAs areas of jurisdiction;
5. Establish frameworks for creating platforms for interaction, collaboration and sharing of resources (i.e. knowledge, skills, experiences and finance)
6. Document and establish dissemination fora/media for all community infrastructure improvement projects in local communities.

**3+
Years**

6.2 Medium-term interventions

1. Develop tools for capacity building, sharing knowledge and building partnerships and cross-sectoral linkages
2. Prepare guidelines and procedures for e procurement of LIT services for organised groups in local communities (i.e. construction, water services, maintenance, micro-finance groups...)
3. Build and transfer LIT skills among marginalised groups in basic infrastructure improvement projects,
4. Identify and address socio-cultural gender constraints and designate tasks and activities for women and youth groups during planning, design and implementation so as to address income and employment equity in basic infrastructure delivery projects
5. Prepare by-laws for effective upkeep including maintenance of community infrastructure services provided in low income settlements.



Acknowledgment

Authors: Written by Prof Wilbard J. Kombe, Alphonse G. Kyessi and Tatu M. Limbumba., Ardhi University. Design and layout by KNOW. (CC) July 2021

Suggested Citation: Ardhi University (2021).Co-production for Basic Infrastructure Improvement, Employment and Income Generation in Low Income Informal Settlements, *KNOW Policy Paper & Policy Brief*, Dar es Salaam: Ardhi University

Contact: Prof Wilbard Kombe kombewilbard@yahoo.com

Pictured above: Road in Hanna Nassif before reconstruction (left) and after (right).
Image: Ardhi University

Front and back cover Image: Women and men in Hanna Nassif involved in labour intensive reconstruction/ improvement works. Image: Ardhi University.



KNOW
Knowledge in Action
for Urban Equality



**UK Research
and Innovation**





KNOW

Knowledge in Action
for Urban Equality

www.urban-know.com

